

STAFF REPORT

DATE September 15, 2015
PLACE 50 W Gay St
TIME 3:00 pm

A CALL TO ORDER

B APPROVAL OF MINUTES

~3:00 Meeting Summary – August 18, 2015

C APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL

~3:05 15-09-001 Address: 577 W Town
Property Owner: Pilot Dogs, Inc.
Applicant: Shaun Breslin, AECOM
To be reviewed: Council Variance

Sub-Districts: West Broad St Arts and Innovation **Dodge Park**

Code Reference: 3323.07 (C) Rezoning and variance review and recommendation

Staff Observations:

Pilot Dogs, Inc. has been an active member of the Franklinton community since 1956. Pilot Dogs' current establishment in Franklinton includes administrative offices, a small dormitory, cafeteria and a small kennel. Pilot Dogs operates an additional large kennel on Greenlawn Avenue and transports dogs between the two facilities on a daily basis.

Pilot Dogs has acquired property adjacent to their current administrative offices within the Dodge Park sub-district of East Franklinton. The property currently houses the United Refrigeration building, four single-family homes, a warehouse building and several other structures. Pilot Dogs is proposing to demolish three concrete block structures associated with United Refrigeration, four single-family homes, a corrugated metal hut, a concrete block garage and all associated driveways and landscaping. Based on previous comments from the EFRB, the applicant is preserving the existing warehouse located on Rich Street.

The proposed replacement use will be a new, one-story, indoor training facility for Pilot Dogs, Inc. The facility is approximately 32,820 square feet and will include indoor kennels, a dedicated veterinary hospital/clinic, administrative offices, and support space. The building will also include shell space for future expansion.

The proposed land use of Kennel is not listed as a permitted use within the East Franklinton District. The applicant has applied for a Council Variance to construct and operate a multi-use building including kennels, administrative offices, and veterinary medical suites. The East Franklinton Review Board will review and provide a recommendation to Columbus City Council on the variance request.

The Pilot Dogs' application will be reviewed as three separate cases:

1. Case #15-09-001: Council Variance
2. Case #15-09-002: New Construction and site work
3. Case #15-09-003: Demolition

Applicable Code Land Use Standard:

Standard	Dodge Park District	Staff Comments
Kennel	Not listed as permitted use	Consistent with plan recommendations- see notes below
Veterinary Medical Suites	Not listed as permitted use	Consistent with plan recommendations- see notes below
Office	Permitted under 5000 SF	Consistent with plan recommendations- see notes below

Applicable Plan Land Use Recommendation:

Standard	Dodge Park	Staff Comments
Medium-density mixed residential	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Includes single-family, duplexes, and townhouses Existing commercial, light-industrial, and institutional uses are recognized and supported but are limited to existing footprints and must comply with zoning and other regulations. 	While the plan recommends existing businesses to be limited to existing footprints within the Dodge Park area, it also recommends a diverse mix of land uses within each area of East Franklinton and respecting existing, appropriate businesses. The expansion of Pilot Dogs in East Franklinton will support an existing and active business within the Dodge Park area and the proposed uses (kennels, administrative offices, and veterinary medical suites) are appropriate for the proposed site.
	Throughout the district, mix new and historic buildings, respect existing, appropriate businesses, emphasize a strong, visible presence for arts, and other creative activities along public streets. (P. 3.3)	See notes above
	The Dodge Park Neighborhood calls for strategic infill of single-family affordable and market-rate houses to reinforce the character of this neighborhood and ensure ongoing affordable housing options. (P. 4.3)	See notes above
	While each area possesses unique characteristics that will shape its future development, many of these strategies will apply equally across the entire neighborhood. Above all, each area should incorporate a diverse mix of land uses. (P. 4.3)	See notes above

The East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan recommends medium-density mixed residential for the Dodge Park sub-district. The recommendation recognizes and supports existing commercial, light-industrial, and institutional uses but recommends the uses be limited to existing footprints. While the plan recommends existing businesses to be limited to existing footprints within the Dodge Park area, it also recommends a diverse mix of land uses within each area of East Franklinton and respecting existing, appropriate businesses. The expansion of Pilot Dogs in East Franklinton will support an existing and active business within the Dodge Park area and the proposed uses (kennels, administrative offices, and veterinary medical suites) are appropriate for the proposed site.

Staff supports Board recommendation of approval to Columbus City Council.

Recommendations: Conceptual Approval Approval Approval with Conditions Disapproval

Conditions:

~3:15 15-09-002 Address: 577 W Town
Property Owner: Pilot Dogs, Inc.
Applicant: Shaun Breslin, AECOM
To be reviewed: New construction and site work

Sub-Districts: West Broad St Arts and Innovation

Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.21 Development Standards

Staff Observations:

As per case # 15-09-001, the applicant is proposing a new, one-story indoor training facility for Pilot Dogs, Inc. The facility is approximately 32,820 square feet and will include indoor kennels, a dedicated veterinary hospital/clinic, administrative offices, support space. The building will also include shell space for future expansion. The plans include preservation of an existing warehouse building on Rich Street and 25 parking spaces on Skidmore Street between the proposed new building and the existing warehouse. Pilot Dogs, Inc. has also submitted an application to the City of Columbus to purchase Minard Alley (right-of-way) in order to more fully control access to the site.

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard (All other uses)	Dodge Park District	Staff Comments
Minimum Front Yard	0'	Consistent
Maximum Front Yard	10' (except w public-private zone)	
Minimum Parking Setback	5'	Consistent
Minimum Side Yard	3'	Consistent
Minimum Fence/Wall Setback	0'	Consistent
Minimum Rear Yard	None	Consistent
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	Consistent
Maximum Bldg Height	3 stories or 35'	Consistent
Building Frontage	All Buildings shall front on Public street	Consistent
Lighting	Per C.C. 3323.21	Not submitted for review
Graphics	Per C.C. 3323.21	Not submitted for review
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between principle building and right-of-way	Consistent
Parking	Office: 1:450 SF 15,960 SF/450 SF = 36 Spaces Bicycle parking = 3 spaces Kennel: 0 spaces	Required parking: 36 spaces Proposed parking: 25 spaces Bicycle parking: unknown Pilot Dogs anticipates five full time employees to occupy the new facility.

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Recommendation	Standard	Staff Comments
Land Use Compatibility		
Architecture—Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building’s appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton. 	Specific materials and colors not provided for staff review. Applicant to present to Board.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New construction should be integrated with the existing fabric and scale of development in surrounding neighborhoods. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A wide range of architectural styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary building design and materials. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building (“foursided” architecture). 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Building frontages that exceed 50 feet in width should consider using vertical piers or other vertical elements, spaced at intervals of 15 feet to 30 feet along the entire building elevation. 	Vertical elements are incorporated throughout elevations, but at larger intervals.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New buildings should be consistent in mass and scale to recommendations in the East Franklinton plan. Larger buildings should be divided into smaller modules or bays. Floor-to-floor heights should appear to be similar to those in nearby traditional buildings, especially first floor windows. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street-level facades are recommended to be as transparent as possible to create an attractive pedestrian environment, except for residential spaces on ground floors. For a primary façade, at least 60 percent of the first-floor wall area (between two feet and ten feet) should be clear/non-tinted window glass, which permits a view of the building’s interior to a minimum depth of four feet. At least 25 percent of upper-floor wall areas should be clear/non-tinted window glass. 	Not consistent. Staff notes the specific use of Kennels and veterinary medical clinic may justify a reduced percentage of transparency and/or non-clear windows. Board review recommended.
Service, Light Industrial and Light Manufacturing Uses	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The development character of East Franklinton includes a variety of businesses, including services, light industrial and light manufacturing. Unless otherwise noted in the plan’s zoning recommendations, such uses are expected to continue in the neighborhood. It should be noted that certain artistic methods are industrial in nature, such as metal work and fabrication, and stone cutting. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New buildings constructed for these uses should exhibit an architectural character in keeping with the neighborhood, relative to materials, design, and color. Loading, storage, and other external activities that generate noise, etc., should not face public sidewalks or residential or institutional uses. Screening of loading and outdoor storage and activities should comply with applicable city code. 	Specific materials and colors not provided for staff review. Applicant to present to Board.
Accessibility	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Promote accessibility and “visibility” in all new construction and rehabilitation of existing buildings 	Consistent

Parking	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Surface parking should be located to the rear or side of street-oriented buildings, with preference for the rear of buildings and screened per code. The use of pervious surfaces for surface parking is encouraged to minimize storm water runoff and increase infiltration. 	Parking located at rear of building. Applicant will be required to meet screening requirements per C.C. 3312
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The minimum setback for parking lots is five feet; parking located adjacent to a public sidewalk, however, can be located closer than five feet, provided that it fully meets all screening requirements. Parking lots and accessory buildings should be located at the rear of the principal building. Where access to the rear of the property is not possible from a public alley or street, up to 50 percent of the parking may be located at the side of the principal building 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Parking reductions may be appropriate for higher density, mixed use projects. Shared parking arrangements may be appropriate. 	Consistent
Signage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In general, signage should be pedestrian in orientation and scale. Walls and blade signs are preferred. Pole signs are generally discouraged. The dimensional standards of the city graphics code should be used unless new standards are developed specific to East Franklinton. 	To be determined
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Signs are recommended to be placed and sized on buildings such that they are in keeping with the scale and size of the building facades and general streetscape so as not to obscure or interfere with architectural lines and details. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Sign design and materials should relate to the general theme of the surrounding district and incorporate the building architecture. Examples include hand-crafted, artisan design and materials. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Freeway-oriented signs, pole signs, sign benches, billboards and other off-premises signs should not be supported. 	
Site Design and Landscaping		
Building Orientation and Setbacks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Buildings should be located parallel to the street on which they front. The primary façade should be located on the major street abutting the building and the secondary façades should be located adjacent to secondary streets, service drives, and alleys. Buildings on corner lots should be oriented to the corner and to the street fronts, and should make a strong tie to the building lines of each street. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The minimum setback for a principal building is zero feet and the maximum setback for a principal building is ten feet, except where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided. Where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided, a maximum setback of 15 feet is permitted for up to 50 percent of the building frontage. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The minimum setback for fences and masonry or stone walls is three feet. Fences or walls along a Public-Private Setback Zone may be located zero feet from the sidewalk. 	Fence location not provided for staff review. Applicant to provide location for Board review.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Primary entrances to buildings should be oriented to the primary public street with at least one operable door on the primary public street. Buildings located at a corner should orient the main entrance to the corner instead of to one of the two abutting streets (only one operable door is necessary). 	Consistent
Buffering and Screening	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Between non-residential and residential uses, screening should be a six-foot board-on-board fence or other comparable material; chain link is not acceptable. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Roof-mounted mechanical units should be screened to their full height should complement the building in terms of color and materials. 	Request for additional information.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Service and loading zones should be located to the rear, side or in an internal location where visibility from public rights-of-way and views from neighboring buildings and properties will be minimized or screened to their full height. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ground-mounted mechanical units and dumpsters should be located to the rear of buildings and screened to their full height on all sides by screening that is complementary to the building in terms of color and materials, or by evergreen plant material. 	Request for additional information.
Landscaping	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Measures should be taken to protect the existing street trees shown to remain on the site plan. The applicant proposes to not remove existing drive aprons along Skidmore and Gift streets. Request for additional information on use and landscaping of parking lot side yard.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Paved areas should be shaded, especially parking lots. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Public, semi-public/private, and private spaces should be demarcated clearly through the use of landscape, walls, fences, gates, pavement treatment, signs, and other methods to denote boundaries and/or buffers. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Barriers to views or light should be reduced by selecting appropriate tree types, pruning thick hedges, and large overhanging tree canopies. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscaping should be used to support storm water management goals for filtration, percolation and erosion control, including rain gardens. 	Request for information regarding storm water management
Street Trees and Streetscape	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street trees are recommended on all public and private streets, with species and spacing approved by the City of Columbus forester. 	Staff recommends street trees planted per forester recommendations

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tree-lined residential and commercial streets should be either established or maintained. 	Staff recommends street trees planted per forester recommendations
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscaping on private property bordering sidewalks should be designed with new elements, such as a new plant form or material, at a scale and intervals appropriate to the site. This is not intended to discourage a uniform street tree or landscape theme, but to add interest to the streetscape and enhance the pedestrian experience. 	Consistent
Landscape Material	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All trees (including street trees) should meet the following minimum size at the time of planting: shade trees 2 inches caliper; ornamental trees 1 1/2 inches caliper; and evergreen trees five feet in height. Tree caliper is measured six inches from the ground. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All trees and landscaping should be well maintained. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Dead items should be replaced within six months or the next planting season, whichever occurs first. The size of the new material should equal the size of the original material when it was installed. 	
Lighting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lighting should be appropriate to its location and utilized to enhance security and highlight distinguishing characteristics of buildings. 	To be determined
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lights should have fully shielded, recessed lamps directed downward to prevent glare and shine above the horizontal plane. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Light standards (poles) should not exceed 18 feet in height. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> For aesthetic compatibility, light standards should be of the same or similar type and color. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lighting levels should provide sufficient illumination to ensure security, but without glare, hot spots, or light spillage through residential windows. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Where appropriate, lighting should highlight special architectural or landscape features and/or prominent buildings and gateways. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Wall-mounted lights should be directed downward. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Soffit-mounted light fixtures should be recessed in the soffit or otherwise fully shielded from view from any property line. 	

Overall, the proposed one-story, indoor training facility is consistent with the recommendations of the EFCCD Plan. The following items that should be considered by the Board: 1. The Plan recommends primary street facades to have 60 percent of the first-floor wall area to be clear/non-tinted glass. This recommendation is not met by the current design, but It is recognized that the specific uses of the building, including kennels, may justify reduced transparency on the first floor; 2. The existing drive aprons to remain on Gift and Skidmore streets; and 3. Street trees: staff recommends street trees per City forester recommendations, and measures be taken to protect street trees shown to remain. Staff supports the requested parking reduction from 36 to 25 spaces. The proposed parking meets the needs of Pilot Dog's current full time employees and any future staff or guests. Bicycle parking should be provided per code requirements.

Staff requests the applicant provide additional information on the following items at the meeting:

1. Exterior building materials
2. Proposed fence location
3. Dumpster and roof-mounted mechanical units screening
4. Use and landscaping for side yard (parking lot)
5. Storm water management plan

The application does not include exterior lighting or graphics and these items will need to be reviewed at a future date.

Recommendations:

Conceptual Approval

Approval

Approval with
Conditions

Disapproval

Conditions:

1. To be determined with Board review of listed items

~3:45

15-09-003

Address: 577 W Town
Property Owner: Pilot Dogs, Inc.
Applicant: Shaun Breslin, AECOM
To be reviewed: Demolition

Sub-Districts:

West Broad St

Arts and Innovation

Dodge Park

Code Reference:

3323.11 (H) Demolition Permits

Staff Observations:

The applicant is proposing to demolish the following structures in order to construct a new, one-story indoor training facility for Pilot Dogs, Inc.:

1. Two (2) single-family homes and (1) detached garage – Parcel ID# 010-026404
2. Three (3) concrete block buildings associated with United Refrigeration – Parcel ID# 010-020900
3. Two (2) single-family homes – Parcel ID# 010-020900
4. One (1) corrugated metal hut – Parcel ID #010-020900

As per case # 15-09-001 and 15-09-002, the new facility (replacement use) is approximately 32,820 square feet and will include indoor kennels, a dedicated veterinary hospital/clinic, administrative offices, support space. The building will also include shell space for future expansion.

Demolition Permit Review:

Standard	Staff Comments
Replacement use reviewed and approved by EFRB	Case # 15-09-002: replacement use Decision pending
Is the property eligible for Columbus or National Registers of Historic Places?	Not eligible

The proposed replacement use is consistent with the recommendations of the EFCCD Plan, and the structures proposed for demolition are not eligible for the Columbus or National Register. The applicant responded to Board comments at the April 21, 2015 regular meeting by adjusting the proposed design to preserve an existing warehouse fronting Rich Street. Pending approval of the replacement use (Case# 15-09-002), staff recommends approval.

Recommendations:

Conceptual Approval

Approval

Approval with
Conditions

Disapproval

Conditions:

~4:00

15-09-004

Address: 566 W Rich
Property Owner: Scott Guiler
Applicant: Ken Garrett, Segna Associates
To be reviewed: Exterior modification – New exterior door

Sub-Districts: West Broad St Arts and Innovation

Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.11 Certificate of approval required

Staff Observations:

566 W Rich is located at the corner of Rich and Gift streets within the Dodge Park sub-district. The existing warehouse is occupied by the Ethical Arts Collective including Peace Love Bling, a locally-based, handcrafted jewelry line, and World Peaces, a designer and importer of Fair Trade Home Décor, as well as other local artists and businesses.

The applicant is proposing a new exterior door and transom window on the east elevation of the building. The door is a required exit based on the Ohio Building Code. The new door and window will replace an existing window and will match the height and width of the existing opening.

The applicant is aware that the current use of the building has not been reviewed by the Board and has submitted a change of use application. However, the use of warehousing is not a permitted use within the Dodge Park sub-district. The applicant has been advised to apply for a Council Variance for use.

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
Architecture—Mixed-Use, Commercial buildings	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton.	Consistent

The proposed exterior modification is consistent with the recommendations of the EFCCD plan. Staff recommends approval.

Recommendations:

Conceptual Approval

Approval

Approval with
Conditions

Disapproval

Conditions:

D STAFF ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

E BOARD APPROVED APPLICATIONS ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

- 188 McDowell | Application #15-08-002
1. Change of Use | Reviewed 08/18/2015 | Issued 08/18/2015
 - 501-503 Walnut | Application #15-08-003
 2. Change of Use | Reviewed 08/18/2015 | Issued 08/18/2015
 - 201 Lucas | Application #15-04-001
 3. Live/Work Multi-family development | Reviewed 07/21/2015 | Issued 08/13/2015

F OTHER BUSINESS

G NEXT MEETING

Tuesday – October 20, 2015 at 50 W Gay St at 3:00 pm.